

ORIGINAL

Marshall Magruder  
PO Box 1267  
Tubac, Arizona 85646



0000129125

RECEIVED

2011 AUG 29 A 11:51

19 August 2011

Arizona Corporation Commission  
DOCKETED

AUG 29 2011

Arizona Corporation Commission  
1200 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

DOCKETED BY

To the Parties in

Dockets W-01303A-09-0343 and SW-01303A-09-0343

~~Dockets W-01303A-08-0227 and SW-01303A-08-0227~~

**Subject: Comments on New Issues, Conclusions and Recommendations**

This party requested on 11 July 2011 to withdraw from the proceedings in Dockets W/WS-01303A-09-0343 which was approved in the Procedural Order of 15 July 2011.

Recent filings in the above four dockets have brought forth three new inter-related issues that require resolution. It should be noted this Party remains an Intervening Party in the proceedings in Dockets W/WS-01303A-08-0227 that led a resultant Decision No. 72047 of 6 January 2011 and also to the later rate case dockets W/WS-01303A-09-0343.

**New Issues:**

First issue. Commission Decision No. 72047 at 123:14-17 requires the Arizona American Water Company [or successor] to file in its next rate case, a Consolidated Rate Structure proposal, applicable to all customers. Apparently, now in these dockets, deconsolidation is now being considered, challenging the precepts set forth in Decision No. 72047. All parties clearly expected that the "next rate case" will include a Consolidated Rate Structure and that the present issues involving Anthem/Agua Fria Wastewater will not impact that decision.

Second Issue. Commission Decision No. 71410 of 8 December 2009 at 81:17-19 requires the Company to file of a low-income tariff for the Agua Fria, Havasu, Mohave, Tubac Sun City West, and Paradise Valley water districts. A filing by the Company on 27 July 2011 states a rate case has been filed for only three water districts in Docket W-01303A-10-0448. This fails to meet the filing requirements as the other statewide water districts were omitted.

Third Issue. The Company requested on 27 July 2011 that development of the administrative procedures to qualify ratepayers for a low-income rate and separate tariff be delayed until 2014. As shown in this party's testimony in these dockets, the only "just and reasonable" rates, without discrimination, are to establish a cost-effective "low income rate schedule" as the First Tier or "Life Line" rates for ALL customers.<sup>1</sup> A First Tier for the first 3,000 or 4,000 gallons of water consumed is based on AAWC's

<sup>1</sup> Arizona Constitution Article XV, Sec. 12, requires rates not to discriminate between "persons or places".

testimony that a person requires about 300 gallons a month to cover all basic needs. This should be the same in all water districts with a consolidated Service Charge under \$15.00 for the 5/8 & 3/4-inch connections and a water consumption or usage rate of \$1.00 or less per 1,000 gallons in the First Tier. At this rate, the First Tier is below the necessary revenue for the company, thus the higher tiers must be increased to ensure that the company receives its required revenue. Since many small businesses water needs are similar to residential customers, the "Life Line" rates should also pertain. There was general agreement during the hearings that a low-income, First Tier rate structure also promotes water conservation, as higher Tier consuming customers would have higher costs/1000 gallons to subsidize the low cost of the "Life Line" First Tier for all customers. This issue clearly belongs in the next rate case along with forthcoming Consolidated Rate Structure proposals.

**Conclusions:**

1. The ongoing AAWC rate case in Docket W-01303A-10-0448 violates Decision No. 72047 since only three of the six AAWC water divisions are included.
2. It is neither cost-effective or "just and reasonable" to propose separate low-income tariffs since such tariffs will discriminate between persons and places, clearly in violation of the Arizona Constitution, Article XV, Section 12.

**Recommendations:**

1. That the AAWC rate case in Docket W-01303A-10-0448 be terminated until all six AAWC water divisions are filed with a Consolidate Rate Structure statewide.
2. That the next AAWC rate cases include a First Tier with a low Service and Consumption charges for ALL customers as a way to ensure all low income customers are covered, thus concurring with the Company's 27 July 2011 request.
3. That the present rates remain until completion of the next water and the next wastewater rate cases when a Consolidated Rate Structures are to be proposed.

Respectfully submitted this date of 19 August 2011, as shown on the Service List below.



Marshall Magruder  
520.398.8587  
[marshall@magruder.org](mailto:marshall@magruder.org)

## Service List

Original and 26 copies of the foregoing are filed this date with:

**Docket Control** (26 copies)  
**Arizona Corporation Commission**  
1200 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2927

**Tenna Jibilian**, Administrative Law Judge  
**Maureen Scott**, Staff Attorney  
**Robin R. Mitchell**, Staff Attorney

Additional Distribution are filed this date by email:

**Dan Pozefsky**, Chief Counsel  
Residential Utility Consumer Office (RUCO)  
1110 West Washington Street, Ste 220  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2958  
[DPozefsky@azruco.gov](mailto:DPozefsky@azruco.gov)

**Paul E. Gilbert**  
**Franklyn D. Jeans**  
Beaus Gilbert PLLC  
4800 North Scottsdale Road, Suite 6000  
Scottsdale, Arizona 85251-7616  
[PGilbert@beusgilbert.com](mailto:PGilbert@beusgilbert.com)  
[FJeans@beusgilbert.com](mailto:FJeans@beusgilbert.com)

**Thomas Broderick**  
Arizona American Water  
19820 N. 7<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 201  
Phoenix, Arizona 85024  
[Thomas.Broderick@amwater.com](mailto:Thomas.Broderick@amwater.com)

**W.R. Hansen**  
12302 Shallow Drive  
Sun City West, Arizona 85375  
[jpbillhansen@gmail.com](mailto:jpbillhansen@gmail.com)

**Joan S. Burke**  
Law Office of Joan S. Burke  
1650 North First Avenue  
Phoenix, Arizona 85003  
[Joan@jsburkelaw.com](mailto:Joan@jsburkelaw.com)  
Electronic service only preferred

**Bradley J. Herrema**  
**Robert J. Saperstein**  
Brownstein Hayatt Farber Schreck, LLP  
21 East Carillo Street  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
[BHerrema@BHFS.com](mailto:BHerrema@BHFS.com)

**Thomas H. Campbell**  
**Michael Hallam**  
Lewis and Rocca, LLP  
40 North Central Avenue, Suite 1900  
Phoenix, Arizona, 85004  
[TCampbell@LRLaw.com](mailto:TCampbell@LRLaw.com)  
[MHallan@LRLaw.com](mailto:MHallan@LRLaw.com)

**Norman D. James**  
Fennemore Craig, PC  
3003 North Central Avenue, Suite 2600  
Phoenix, Arizona 85012  
[njames@fclaw.com](mailto:njames@fclaw.com)

**Jeff Crockett**  
**Robert Metli**  
Snell & Wilmer  
One Arizona Center  
400 East Van Buren Street  
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2202  
[rmetli@swlaw.com](mailto:rmetli@swlaw.com)  
[Jcrockett@swlaw.com](mailto:Jcrockett@swlaw.com)

**Craig A. Marks**  
Craig A. Marks, PLC  
10645 North Tatum Blvd, Suite 200-676  
Phoenix, Arizona 85028  
[Craig.Marks@azbar.org](mailto:Craig.Marks@azbar.org)

**Judith M. Dworkin**  
**Roxanne S. Gallagher**  
Sacks Tiernery PA  
4250 N. Drinkwater Blvd, Fourth Floor  
Scottsdale, Arizona 85251-3693  
[Judith.Dworkin@sackstierney.com](mailto:Judith.Dworkin@sackstierney.com)

**Andrew Miller**, Town Attorney  
Town of Paradise Valley  
6401 East Lincoln Drive  
Paradise Valley, Arizona 85353-4328  
[amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov](mailto:amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov)

**Michael Patten**  
**Timothy J. Sabo**  
Roshka DeWuld & Patten PLC  
400 East Van Buren Suite 800  
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2262  
[mpatten@rdp-law.com](mailto:mpatten@rdp-law.com)

**Greg Patterson**  
916 West Adams Street, Suite 3  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007  
[Gpatterson3@cox.net](mailto:Gpatterson3@cox.net)

**Lawrence V. Robertson, Jr.**  
PO Box 1448  
Tubac, AZ 85646-1148  
[tubacattorney@aol.com](mailto:tubacattorney@aol.com)

**Larry Woods**  
13815 East Camino Del Sol  
Sun City West, Arizona 85375  
[Larry.Woods@AOL.com](mailto:Larry.Woods@AOL.com)

Copy of the foregoing mailed on this date to:

**Thomas J. Ambrose**  
7326 East Montebello Avenue  
Scottsdale, AZ 85250-6045

**Philip H. Cook**  
10122 West Signal Butte Circle  
Sun City, Arizona 85373

**Pauline A. Harris Henry**  
Russell Ranch Homeowners Association, Inc.  
21448 N. 75th Avenue, Suite 6  
Glendale, Arizona 85308

**Desi Howe**  
Anthem Golf & Country Club  
2708 West Anthem Club Drive  
Anthem, Arizona 85086

**Carol McHale-Hubbs**  
21511 North Limousine Drive  
Sun City West, AZ 85375-6557

**Michele Van Quathem**  
Ryley Carlock & Applewhite  
One North Central Avenue, Suite 1200  
Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417

**Troy B. Stratman**  
Mack Drucker & Watson PLC  
3200 North Central Avenue, Suite 1200  
Phoenix, AZ 85012

**Gary Verburg**, City Attorney  
**Danial L. Brown**, Assistant City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney  
Phoenix, Arizona 85003

**Nicholas Wright**  
Representing self and 22 Intervenors (2  
copies)  
1942 East Desert Greens Drive  
Fort Mohave, Arizona 84626-8883