

OPEN MEETING ITEM



0000092461

COMMISSIONERS
KRISTIN K. MAYES - Chairman
GARY PIERCE
PAUL NEWMAN
SANDRA D. KENNEDY
BOB STUMP



ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION

ORIGINAL

DATE: JANUARY 16, 2009

DOCKET NO: T-03632A-06-0091; T-03267A-06-0091; T-04302A-06-0091;
T-03406A-06-0091; T-03432A-06-0091; T-01051B-06-0091

TO ALL PARTIES:

Enclosed please find the recommendation of Administrative Law Judge Jane Rodda. The recommendation has been filed in the form of an Order on:

DIECA COMMUNICATIONS DBA COVAD
COMMUNICATIONS COMPANY, ESCHELON TELECOM OF
ARIZONA, INC., MCLEODUSA TELECOMMUNICATIONS
SERVICES, INC., MOUNTAIN TELECOMMUNICATIONS,
INC., XO COMMUNICATIONS SERVICES, INC. AND
QWEST CORPORATION

(2007 AND 2008 ADDITIONS TO WIRE CENTERS)

Pursuant to A.A.C. R14-3-110(B), you may file exceptions to the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge by filing an original and thirteen (13) copies of the exceptions with the Commission's Docket Control at the address listed below by **4:00** p.m. on or before:

JANUARY 26, 2009

The enclosed is NOT an order of the Commission, but a recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge to the Commissioners. Consideration of this matter has tentatively been scheduled for the Commission's Open Meeting to be held on:

FEBRUARY 3, 2009 AND FEBRUARY 4, 2009

For more information, you may contact Docket Control at (602)542-3477 or the Hearing Division at (602)542-4250. For information about the Open Meeting, contact the Executive Director's Office at (602) 542-3931.

BRIAN C. McNEIL
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

Arizona Corporation Commission

DOCKETED

JAN 16 2009

DOCKETED BY

RECEIVED
2009 JAN 16 P 3:11
AZ CORP COMMISSION
DOCKET CONTROL

1 **BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION**

2 COMMISSIONERS

3 KRISTIN K. MAYES, Chairman
4 GARY PIERCE
5 PAUL NEWMAN
6 SANDRA D. KENNEDY
7 BOB STUMP

7 IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF
8 DIECA COMMUNICATIONS DBA COVAD
9 COMMUNICATIONS COMPANY, ESCHOLON
10 TELECOM OF ARIZONA, INC., MCLEODUSA
11 TELECOMMUNICATIONS SERVICES, INC.,
12 MOUNTAIN TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC.,
13 XO COMMUNICATIONS SERVICES, INC. AND
14 QWEST CORPORATION'S REQUEST FOR
15 COMMISSION PROCESS TO ADDRESS KEY
16 UNE ISSUES ARISING FROM TRIENNIAL
17 REVIEW REMAND ORDER, INCLUDING
18 APPROVAL OF QWEST WIRE CENTER LISTS.

DOCKET NO. T-03632A-06-0091
T-03267A-06-0091
T-04302A-06-0091
T-03406A-06-0091
T-03432A-06-0091
T-01051B-06-0091

DECISION NO. _____

ORDER
(Phase II)

14 Open Meeting
15 February 3 and 4, 2009
16 Phoenix, Arizona

17 **BY THE COMMISSION:**

18 * * * * *

19 Having considered the entire record herein and being fully advised in the premises, the
20 Arizona Corporation Commission ("Commission") finds, concludes, and orders that:

21 **FINDINGS OF FACT**

22 **Procedural History**

23 1. On June 22, 2007, Qwest Corporation ("Qwest") filed an Application for Approval of
24 2007 Additions to Non-Impaired Wire Center List ("2007 Additions Application").¹

25 2. On June 29, 2007, Qwest filed the Publicly Available Data in Support of its 2007
26 Additions Application.

27 _____
28 ¹ Qwest filed its 2007 Additions Application while the proceeding to approve the initial list of unimpaired wire centers was still being considered.

1 *Unbundling Obligations of Incumbent Local Exchange Carriers, Order on Remand* (effective March
2 11, 2005) (Triennial Review Remand Order) (FCC 04-290) (“TRRO”).

3 9. In the *TRO*, the FCC established criteria for determining which unbundled network
4 elements (“UNEs”) had to be made available by Incumbent Local Exchange Carriers (“ILECs”) to
5 Competitive Local Exchange Carriers (“CLECs”) under Section 251(c) of the Telecommunications
6 Act of 1996 (the “1996 Act”). Pursuant to the *TRO*, an ILEC would have to make a network element
7 available to the CLECs on an unbundled basis if the requesting carrier was impaired, such that lack of
8 access to that network element would pose a barrier to entry.

9 10. In the *TRRO* the FCC, among other things, established the standards for determining
10 impairment for high-capacity dedicated transport and loops. The standards hinge on the number of
11 business lines and fiber-based collocators in the individual wire centers. Under the *TRRO*’s criteria,
12 CLECs are deemed not to be impaired without access to DS1 transport on routes connecting a pair of
13 wire centers where both wire centers contain at least four (4) fiber-based collocators or at least 38,000
14 business access lines. Wire centers meeting these criteria are referred to as “Tier 1” wire centers.
15 For DS3 transport and dark fiber transport, the *TRRO* established there is no impairment on routes
16 connecting wire centers where both wire centers contain at least three fiber-based collocators or at
17 least 24,000 business lines. Wire centers with three or more fiber-based collocators or 24,000 or
18 more business lines are “Tier 2” wire centers. For DS1 loops, CLECs are not impaired in any
19 building within the service area of a wire center containing 60,000 or more business lines and four or
20 more fiber-based collocators; and for DS3 loops CLECs are not impaired within a wire center
21 service area containing 38,000 or more business lines and four or more fiber-based collocators.

22 11. A wire center is the location of the ILEC local switching facility containing one or
23 more Central Offices, and defines the area in which all customers serviced by a given wire center are
24 located. When wire centers are designated as unimpaired for certain services, CLECs are no longer
25 able to access those services at Total Element Long Run Incremental Cost (“*TELRIC*”)³ prices, and
26 CLECs must transition to facilities of their own, to alternative services from another provider, or
27

28 ³ *TELRIC* is a means to determine the price of a service based on the incremental cost of new equipment and labor, not counting the embedded cost of the old equipment or the labor to install the old equipment.

1 from the ILEC at tariff prices.

2 **2007 and 2008 Additions Applications**

3 12. Following a Procedural Conference on June 30, 2008, a Procedural Order dated
4 August 25, 2008, established procedures for the review of the 2007 and 2008 Additions Applications.
5 The August 25, 2008, Procedural Order was mailed to all CLECs with current interconnection
6 agreements with Qwest and provided notice to such CLECs of their opportunity to participate in the
7 Docket. Because of the extensive list of such CLECs, those desiring to remain on the service list
8 were directed to make an affirmative request to continue to receive filings. In addition, the August
9 25, 2008, Procedural Order adopted a Protective Order that would apply to Phase II of the proceeding
10 as well as all future Phases of this docket. CLECs were given at least 30 days to review and execute
11 the Protective Order and an additional 30 days to review data supporting Qwest's 2007 and 2008
12 Additions Applications and to file any objections to Qwest's designations.

13 13. In addition to the Joint CLECs, National Brands, Inc. dba Sharenet Communications
14 Company requested to remain on the service list.

15 14. In its 2007 Additions Application, Qwest sought to add the following Arizona wire
16 centers to the list of unimpaired wire centers:

<u>Wire Center</u>	<u>CLLI</u>	<u>TIER</u>	<u>Non-Impairment For</u>
Chandler Main	CHNDAZMA	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Chandler West	CHNDAZWE	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Cactus	PHNXASCA	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Greenway	PHNXASGR	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Southeast	PHNXAZSE	Tier 1	DS1 & DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Sunnyslope	PHNXAZSY	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix West	PHNXAZWE	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Superstition West	SPRSAZWE	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF

26 15. In the 2008 Additions Application, Qwest sought to add the following Arizona wire
27 centers to the list of unimpaired wire centers:
28

<u>Wire Center</u>	<u>CLLI</u>	<u>TIER</u>	<u>Non-Impairment For</u>
Gilbert	MESAAZG1	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Deer Valley North	DRVYAZNO	Tier 1	DS1 & DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Southeast	PHNXAZSE	Tier 1	DS1 & DS3 Transport & DF

16. On October 27, 2008, the Joint CLECs filed objections to approval of the following wire center designations:

2007 -- Superstition West (SPRSAZWE)

2008 -- Gilbert (MESAAZGI)

The Joint CLECs requested a procedural conference to determine procedures for resolving the disputed designations.

17. On November 12, 2008, the Commission's Utilities Division ("Staff") filed its Comments on Qwest's 2007 and 2008 Proposed Additions to Non-impaired Wire Center Designations. Staff found the methodology Qwest used for selecting the 2007 and 2008 non-impaired wire center designations to be in compliance with Section V of the Wire Center Settlement Agreement. Staff recommended convening a Procedural Conference to discuss a process for resolving the Joint CLEC objections.

18. On November 13, 2008, the Joint CLECs filed an amended Objection to Qwest's Proposed Additions. The Joint CLECs confirmed that based on information Qwest provided to them, they were withdrawing their objection to the Gilbert (MESAAZGI) wire center.

19. By Procedural Order dated November 19, 2008, a Procedural Conference was set to commence on December 11, 2008.

20. On December 10, 2008, the Joint CLECs filed a Withdrawal of Objection to Qwest's Proposed Additions to Non-Impaired Wire Center Designation, which withdrew the objection to the Superstition West wire center. With that filing, the Joint CLECs removed their only remaining objection to any of the wire centers included in Qwest's 2007 or 2008 Additions Applications. The Joint CLECs reserved their right to participate in this docket with respect to further issues or disputes, if any, raised by Staff or other CLECs, or the effective date of the proposed designations.

1 21. Qwest, the Joint CLECs and Staff appeared through counsel at the December 11,
2 2008, Procedural Conference. At that time, all parties, including Staff, confirmed that they had no
3 objections to Qwest's designations as set forth in its 2007 or 2008 Additions Applications, and
4 recommended that the Phase II designations be approved.

5 22. Qwest provided data of business line counts, by type of circuit and by CLEC, and the
6 inventory of fiber-based collocators, in support of the designations for each of the wire centers
7 included in its 2007 and 2008 Additions Applications.

8 23. No entity objected to the designations of non-impairment or tiers set forth in the 2007
9 and 2008 Additions Applications. Qwest complied with the methodology for selecting non-impaired
10 wire centers as set forth in Section V of the Wire Center Settlement Agreement. There is no evidence
11 that the line counts or inventories of fiber-based providers provided by Qwest do not meet the criteria
12 established in the *TRRO*.

13 24. Qwest's 2007 and 2008 Additions Applications should be approved, and the wire
14 center designations set forth therein added to the list of unimpaired wire centers.

15 25. Qwest and the signing Joint CLECS agreed in the Wire Center Settlement Agreement
16 that the effective date of uncontested wire center designations would be "thirty (30) days after the
17 [date Qwest submits its non-impairment or tier designation filing, with supporting date] unless the
18 Commission orders otherwise."⁴ They further agreed that if there was an objection to Qwest's
19 proposed non-impairment designation they would request that the Commission attempt to resolve the
20 dispute within 60 days.⁵ The terms of the Wire Center Settlement Agreement do not bind non-party
21 CLECs. Under the circumstances, including the procedural history of these Additions Applications,
22 and in the interest of ease of administration, it is reasonable that the effective date of the unimpaired
23 designations in the 2007 and 2008 Additions Applications should be the effective date of this
24 Decision.

25 ...

26 ...

27 _____
28 ⁴ Wire Center Settlement Agreement at Section V.F.2 (Attached to Decision No. 70355 as Exhibit A).

⁵ Wire Center Settlement Agreement at Section V.F.3.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1
2 1. Qwest is a public service corporation within the meaning of Article XV of the Arizona
3 Constitution.

4 2. Qwest is an ILEC within the meaning of 47 U.S.C. § 252.

5 3. The Commission has jurisdiction over Qwest and the subject matter of the 2007 and
6 2008 Additions Applications.

7 4. Notice of the proceeding was provided in conformance with law.

8 5. Qwest's designations of non-impaired wire centers, as set forth in its 2007 and 2008
9 Additions Applications, meet the criteria for non-impairment as set forth in the *TRRO*, and the
10 designated wire centers should be added to the list of unimpaired wire centers.

ORDER

11
12 IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the following wire centers shall be added to the list of
13 non-impaired wire centers, with an effective designation date concurrent with the effective date of
14 this Decision:

<u>Wire Center</u>	<u>CLLI</u>	<u>TIER</u>	<u>Non-Impairment For</u>
Chandler Main	CHNDAZMA	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Chandler West	CHNDAZWE	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Cactus	PHNXASCA	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Greenway	PHNXASGR	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Southeast	PHNXAZSE	Tier 1	DS1 & DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Sunnyslope	PHNXAZSY	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix West	PHNXAZWE	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Superstition West	SPRSAZWE	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Gilbert	MESAAZG1	Tier 2	DS3 Transport & DF
Deer Valley North	DRVYAZNO	Tier 1	DS1 & DS3 Transport & DF
Phoenix Southeast	PHNXAZSE	Tier 1	DS1 & DS3 Transport & DF

1 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the procedures established in Decision No. 70355
2 concerning the filing of future phases in this docket shall continue to apply and that when Qwest
3 Corporation makes future filings to update the unimpaired wire center list, it shall request a
4 Procedural Conference, at which time the Commission will establish procedures to govern the next
5 phase of the proceeding.

6 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Decision shall become effective immediately.

7 BY ORDER OF THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION.
8
9

10 CHAIRMAN

COMMISSIONER

11
12 COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER

13
14 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I, BRIAN C. McNEIL, Executive
15 Director of the Arizona Corporation Commission, have
16 hereunto set my hand and caused the official seal of the
17 Commission to be affixed at the Capitol, in the City of Phoenix,
18 this ____ day of _____, 2009.

19 BRIAN C. McNEIL
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

20 DISSENT _____

21
22 DISSENT _____
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 SERVICE LIST FOR: DIECA COMMUNICATIONS DBA COVAD
2 COMMUNICATIONS COMPANY, ESCHELON TELECOM OF
3 ARIZONA, INC., MCLEODUSA TELECOMMUNICATIONS
4 SERVICES, INC., MOUNTAIN TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC.,
XO COMMUNICATIONS SERVICES, INC. AND QWEST
CORPORATION

5 DOCKET NOS.: T-03632A-06-0091; T-03267A-06-0091; T-04302A-06-0091;
6 T-03406A-06-0091; T-03432A-06-0091; T-01051B-06-0091

7 Greg Diamond
8 COVAD COMMUNICATIONS COMPANY
9 7901 East Lowry Boulevard
10 Denver, CO 80230-6507

11 William Haas
12 MCLEODUSA TELECOMMUNICATIONS
13 SERVICES, INC.
14 6400 C Street SW
15 P.O. Box 3177
16 Cedar Rapids, IA 52406-3177

17 Mike Hazel
18 MOUNTAIN TELECOMMUNICATIONS
19 1430 West Broadway Street, Suite 206
20 Tempe, AZ 85282-1100

21 Rex Knowles
22 XO COMMUNICATIONS SERVICES
23 111 East Broadway Street, Suite 1000
24 Salt Lake City, UT 84111-5261

25 Norman G. Curtright
26 QWEST CORPORATION
27 20 East Thomas Road, 16th Floor
28 Phoenix, AZ 85012-3114

Michael W. Patten
ROSHKA, DEWULF & PATTEN, PLC
400 East Van Buren Street, Suite 800
Phoenix, AZ 85004-2262

Douglas Denney, Senior Attorney
ESCHELON TELECOM, INC.
730 Second Avenue S., Suite 900
Minneapolis, MN 55402-2489

Thomas W. Bade
ARIZONA DIALTONE, INC.
76115 South Kyrene Road, No. 103
Tempe, AZ 85283-1758

1 Gary Joseph, Vice President
2 NATIONAL BRANDS, INC.
3 dba SHARENET COMMUNICATIONS
4 4633 West Polk Street
5 Phoenix, AZ 85043-2902

6 Brad VanLeur, President
7 ORBITCOM
8 1701 North Louise Avenue
9 Sioux Falls, SD 57107-0210

10 Michel Singer Nelson
11 Associate General Counsel
12 360NETWORKS (USA) INC.
13 867 Coal Creek, Suite 160
14 Louisville, CO 80027-4670

15 Janice Alward, Chief Counsel
16 Legal Division
17 ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
18 1200 West Washington Street
19 Phoenix, AZ 85007-2927

20 Ernest G. Johnson, Director
21 Utilities Division
22 ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
23 1200 West Washington Street
24 Phoenix, AZ 85007-2927

25
26
27
28