



BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION

COMMISSIONERS

MIKE GLEASON - Chairman
WILLIAM A. MUNDELL
JEFF HATCH-MILLER
KRISTIN K. MAYES
GARY PIERCE

Arizona Corporation Commission
DOCKETED
AUG 28 2007

DOCKETED BY nr

IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF
NAVIGATOR TELECOMMUNICATIONS, LLC
FOR A CERTIFICATE OF CONVENIENCE AND
NECESSITY TO PROVIDE RESOLD LOCAL
EXCHANGE, FACILITIES-BASED LOCAL
EXCHANGE, AND ACCESS
TELECOMMUNICATIONS SERVICES IN
ARIZONA.

DOCKET NO. T-20398A-06-0346

DECISION NO. 69884

OPINION AND ORDER

DATE OF HEARING: May 30, 2007
PLACE OF HEARING: Phoenix, Arizona
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE: Yvette B. Kinsey
APPEARANCES: Mr. Michael Hallam, LEWIS & ROCA, LLP, on behalf
of the Applicant; and
Ms. Robin Mitchell, Staff Attorney, Legal Division, on
behalf of the Utilities Division of the Arizona
Corporation Commission.

BY THE COMMISSION:

On May 25, 2006, Navigator Telecommunications, LLC ("Navigator" or "Applicant") submitted to the Arizona Corporation Commission ("Commission") an application for a Certificate of Convenience and Necessity ("Certificate" or "CC&N") to provide resold local exchange, facilities-based local exchange and access telecommunications services within the State of Arizona. The Applicant also requested that its services be classified as competitive.

On June 19, 2006, the Commission's Utilities Division Staff ("Staff") filed a Letter of Insufficiency stating that the Applicant's application had not met the sufficiency requirements as outlined in the Arizona Administrative Code. ("A.A.C").

From November 7, 2006, to February 6, 2007, Navigator filed amendments to its application.

1 On March 28, 2007, Staff filed its Staff Report recommending approval of Navigator's
2 application subject to certain conditions.

3 On April 17, 2007, by Procedural Order the hearing in this matter was scheduled to
4 commence on May 30, 2007.

5 On May 30, 2007, a full public hearing was held in this matter. Applicant and Staff appeared
6 through counsel and presented evidence and testimony. At the conclusion of the hearing, the
7 Applicant was directed to file an updated financial statement and the time clock was extended in this
8 matter.

9 On May 31, 2007, Applicant filed its late filed exhibit.

10 * * * * *

11 Having considered the entire record herein and being fully advised in the premises, the
12 Commission finds, concludes, and orders that:

13 **FINDINGS OF FACT**

14 1. In Commission Decision No. 58926 (December 22, 1994), the Commission found that
15 resold telecommunications providers ("resellers") are public service corporations subject to the
16 jurisdiction of the Commission.

17 2. In Commission Decision No. 68928 (August 29, 2006), the Commission granted
18 Navigator authority to provide resold long distance services in Arizona.

19 3. Notice of Navigator's application was given in accordance with the law.

20 4. Navigator's application in this docket seeks authority to provide business local
21 exchange and access services, by utilizing the facilities of the Incumbent Local Exchange Carrier
22 ("ILEC")(Qwest) and any other facilities available from other providers.

23 5. Navigator is currently authorized to provide local exchange and access
24 telecommunications services in 34 states.

25 6. Navigator also is authorized to provide long distance services in 44 states and
26 Washington, D.C.

27 7. Navigator is headquartered in North Little Rock, Arkansas and it employs 90
28 employees.

1 8. Navigator intends to eventually open a sales office in Arizona.

2 9. Navigator has been providing telecommunications services since 1998.

3 10. Based on its service history, Staff concluded that Navigator possesses the technical
4 capabilities to provide the services it is requesting authority to provide in Arizona.

5 11. Applicant provided Staff with audited financial statements for the years 2002, 2003,
6 2004, and 2005.

7 12. Applicant submitted audited financial statements for the year 2006 after the hearing.

8 13. Applicant's 2006 financial statements lists assets of \$6,262,198; Member's deficit of
9 \$11, 722,269; and a net loss of \$2,119,190.

10 14. Navigator will not collect deposits, prepayments or advances from its local exchange
11 customers.

12 15. Navigator's local exchange customers should be protected by the procurement of
13 either a performance bond or an irrevocable sight draft letter of credit.

14 16. The amount of the performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of credit should
15 be the aggregate amount for the multiple telecommunications services Navigator is requesting
16 authority to provide.

17 17. Navigator should procure a performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of credit
18 in the amount of \$25,000 for resold local exchange and \$100,000 for facilities based local exchange,
19 for a total aggregate amount of \$125,000.

20 18. If Navigator collects, at some future date, advance payments or deposits, the
21 performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of credit should increase in increments equal to 50
22 percent of the total minimum bond or sight draft letter of credit amount when the total amount of the
23 advances, deposits and/or prepayments is within 10 percent of the total minimum bond or sight draft
24 letter of credit.

25 19. The minimum performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of credit amount of
26 \$125,000 should be increased if at any time it would be insufficient to cover advances, deposits
27 and/or prepayments collected from Navigator's customers. The performance bond or irrevocable
28 sight draft letter of credit should be increased increments of \$62,500 and the increase should occur

1 when the total amount of the advances, deposits, and prepayments is within \$12,500 of the
2 performance bond or the irrevocable sight draft letter of credit amount.

3 20. Staff recommends that Navigator provide proof of its performance bond or irrevocable
4 sight draft letter of credit by sending the original bond or sight draft letter directly to the
5 Commission's Business Office, and provide 14 copies to Docket Control, within 365 days of the
6 effective date of an Order in this matter or 30 days prior to the provision of service, whichever comes
7 first, and that the performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of credit remain in effect until
8 further Order of the Commission.

9 21. If, at some future date, Navigator desires to discontinue its telecommunications
10 services in Arizona, pursuant to A.A.C. R14-2-1107, Navigator must file an application with the
11 Commission, and notify its customers and the Commission 60 days prior to filing the application that
12 it plans discontinue service. Failure to meet the requirements under the rule will cause a forfeiture of
13 Navigator's performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of credit.

14 22. Navigator will be providing service in areas where it will have to compete with other
15 ILEC and competitive local exchange carriers ("CLECs").

16 23. Navigator will not be able to exert any market power in the areas it is requesting to
17 serve and the competitive process will result in rates that are just and reasonable.

18 24. Pursuant to A.A.C. R14-2-1109, Navigator may charge rates for service that are not
19 less than its total service long-run incremental costs of providing service.

20 25. Navigator's proposed rates are for competitive services. In general, rates for
21 competitive services are not set according to the rate of return regulation. Navigator's fair value rate
22 base ("FVRB") is zero. Staff reviewed the rates to be charged by Navigator and they are just and
23 reasonable as they are comparable to other CLECs and ILECs operating in Arizona. Staff concluded
24 that although Navigator's FVRB was considered, it should not be given substantial weight in this
25 analysis.

26 26. Pursuant to A.A.C. R14-2-1308(A) and federal laws and rules, Navigator shall make
27 number portability available to facilitate the ability of the customer to switch between authorized
28 local carriers within a given wire center without changing their telephone number and without

1 impairment to quality, functionality, reliability or convenience of use.

2 27. In compliance with A.A.C. R14-2-1204 (A), all telecommunications service providers
3 that interconnect into the public switched network shall provide funding for the Arizona Universal
4 Service Fund ("AUSF"). Navigator will contribute to the AUSF as required by the A.A.C.

5 28. The quality of service standards outlined for Qwest in Commission Decision No.
6 59421 (December 20, 1995) applies to Navigator. However, Staff believes that because Navigator
7 has not had any unsatisfactory service issues and will be operating in a competitive environment, the
8 penalties outlined in the above referenced Decision should not apply.

9 29. In areas where Navigator is the only local exchange service provider, Navigator
10 should be prohibited from barring access to alternative local exchange service providers who wish to
11 serve the area.

12 30. Navigator will provide all customers with 911 and E911 service where available, or
13 will coordinate with ILECs, and emergency service providers to provide the service.

14 31. Pursuant to past Commission Decisions, Navigator may offer custom local area
15 signaling services such as Caller ID and Call Blocking, so long as the customer is able to block or
16 unblock each individual call at no additional cost.

17 32. Navigator must also offer Last Call Return service that will not return calls to
18 telephone numbers that have the privacy indicator activated.

19 33. According to Staff's Report, Navigator has not had an application for service denied
20 or revoked in any state, and there have been no formal complaint proceedings and no civil or criminal
21 proceedings involving Navigator.

22 34. The Consumer Services Division showed no complaints filed against Navigator in
23 Arizona.

24 35. Navigator certified that none of its officers, directors or partners have been involved in
25 any civil or criminal investigations, or formal or informal complaints, and none of its officers,
26 directors, or partners have been convicted of any criminal acts in the past ten (10) years.

27 36. Navigator has requested that its telecommunications in Arizona be classified as
28 competitive.

1 37. Staff recommends that Navigator's proposed services be classified as competitive
2 because there are alternatives to Navigator's services; Navigator will have to convince customers to
3 purchase its services; Navigator has no ability to adversely affect the local exchange or interexchange
4 service markets; and Navigator will therefore have no market power in those local exchange or
5 interexchange service markets where alternative providers to telecommunications services exist.

6 38. Access service includes common line, switched access, optional features and functions
7 and other miscellaneous service needed to provide the ability to enter or exit a local exchange
8 network for the purposes of originating or terminating long distance communications.

9 39. Based on Navigator's tariffs, Navigator's access service rates are comparable to the
10 rates of other access service providers in Arizona.

11 40. Navigator will have to compete with incumbent and other competitive access
12 providers in order to obtain customers for its services.

13 41. Navigator will not be able to exert any market power and the competitive process will
14 result in rates that are just and reasonable.

15 42. Navigator expects to begin business in Arizona within 30-40 days after a decision in
16 this matter.

17 43. Staff recommends approval of Navigator's application for a CC&N to provide
18 intrastate telecommunications services. Staff further recommends:

19 (a) That Navigator comply with all Commission Rules, Orders and other
20 requirements relevant to the provision of the intrastate telecommunications
21 services;

22 (b) That Navigator abide by the quality of service standards that were approved by the
23 Commission for Qwest in Docket No. T-01051B-93-0183;

24 (c) That Navigator be prohibited from barring access to alternative local exchange
25 service providers who wish to serve areas where Navigator is the only provider of
26 the local exchange service facilities;

27 (d) That Navigator be required to notify the Commission immediately upon changes to
28 its name, address or telephone number;

 (e) That Navigator cooperate with Commission investigations including, but not
 limited to customer complaints;

- 1 (f) That although Staff considered the fair value rate base information submitted by
2 Navigator, the fair value information provided was not given substantial weight in
3 this analysis;
- 4 (g) If at some future date, Navigator wants to collect advances, deposits and/or
5 prepayments from its resold local service customers, Navigator should be required
6 to file an application with the Commission for Commission approval.
7 Additionally, Navigator's application must reference the Decision in this docket
8 and must explain Navigator's plans for procuring its performance bond;
- 9 (h) That Navigator offer Caller ID with the capability to toggle between blocking and
10 unblocking the transmission of the telephone number at no charge;
- 11 (i) That Navigator offer Last Call Return service that will not return calls to telephone
12 numbers that have the privacy indicator activated; and
- 13 (j) That Navigator be authorized to discount its rates and service charges to the
14 marginal cost of providing the services.

15 44. Staff further recommends Navigator comply with the following conditions within the
16 timeframes outlined or Navigator's CC&N should be considered null and void, after due process.

- 17 (1) That Navigator docket conforming tariffs for each service it will provide, within 365
18 days of the effective date of a Decision in this matter or 30 days prior to providing
19 service in Arizona, whichever comes first. Additionally, the tariffs submitted to the
20 Commission should coincide with the application and state that Navigator does not
21 collect advances, deposits, and or/or prepayments from its customers.
- 22 (2) Navigator shall:
- 23 (a) Procure a performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of credit equal to
24 \$125,000. The minimum performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of
25 credit amount of \$125,000 should be increased if at any time it would be
26 insufficient to cover advances, deposits, and/or prepayments collected from
27 Navigator's customers. The performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of
28 credit amount should be increased in increments of \$62,500. The increase should
occur when the total amount of advances, deposits, and prepayments is within
\$12,500 of the performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of credit amount.
- (b) Docket proof of the performance bond or irrevocable sight draft letter of credit

1 within 365 days of the effective date of a Decision in this matter or 30 days prior
2 to the provision of service, whichever comes first. The performance bond or
3 irrevocable sight draft letter of credit must remain in effect until further Order of
4 the Commission.

5 45. Staff recommendations, as set forth herein are reasonable.

6 46. The rates proposed by this filing are for competitive services.

7 47. Applicant is a fit and proper entity to receive a CC&N to provide resold local
8 exchange, facilities based local exchange and access telecommunication services in Arizona, subject
9 to Staff's recommendations.

10 CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

11 1. Applicant is a public service corporation within the meaning of Article XV of the
12 Arizona Constitution and A.R.S. §40-281 and 40-282.

13 2. The Commission has jurisdiction over Applicant and the subject matter of the
14 application.

15 3. A.R.S §§ 40-282 allows a telecommunications company to file an application for a
16 CC&N to provide competitive telecommunications services.

17 4. Pursuant to Article XV of the Arizona Constitution, as well as the Arizona Revised
18 Statutes, it is in the public interest for Applicant to provide the telecommunications services set forth
19 in its application.

20 5. Pursuant to Article XV of the Arizona Constitution as well as the Competitive Rules,
21 it is just and reasonable and in the public interest for Applicant to establish rates and charges that are
22 not less than the Applicant's total service long-run incremental costs of providing the competitive
23 services approved herein.

24 ORDER

25 IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the application of Navigator Telecommunications, LLC
26 for a Certificate of Convenience and Necessity for authority to provide resold local exchange,
27 facilities based local exchange and access telecommunications services in Arizona, is hereby granted,
28 conditioned upon compliance with Staff's recommendations set forth above.

1 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that if Navigator Telecommunications, LLC fails to meet the
2 time frames outlined in Findings of Fact No. 44, the Certificate of Convenience and Necessity
3 conditionally granted herein shall become null and void, after due process.

4 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Decision shall become effective immediately.

5 BY ORDER OF THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION.

6
7 Samuel Williams William
8 CHAIRMAN COMMISSIONER

9 Jeffrey M. Hatch Miller Ryan Gary Stein
10 COMMISSIONER COMMISSIONER COMMISSIONER

11
12 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I, DEAN S. MILLER, Interim
13 Executive Director of the Arizona Corporation Commission,
14 have hereunto set my hand and caused the official seal of the
15 Commission to be affixed at the Capitol, in the City of Phoenix,
16 this 28 day of August, 2007.

17
18 Dean S. Miller
19 DEAN S. MILLER
20 INTERIM EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000

DISSENT _____
DISSENT _____
YBK:db

1 SERVICE LIST FOR: NAVIGATOR TELECOMMUNICATIONS, LLC

2 DOCKET NO.: T-20398A-06-0346

3
4 Michael Hallam
5 LEWIS AND ROCA, LLP
6 40 N. Central Ave., Suite 1900
7 Phoenix, AZ 85004
8 Attorneys for Navigator Telecommunications, LLC

9
10 Christopher Kempley, Chief Counsel
11 Legal Division
12 ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
13 1200 West Washington Street
14 Phoenix, AZ 85007

15
16 Ernest G. Johnson, Director
17 Utilities Division
18 ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
19 1200 West Washington
20 Phoenix, AZ 85007

21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28