

**ORIGINAL**

Southern California Edison (C)  
Devers 2 - Palo Verde Trans  
L-00000A-06-0295-00130



0000073509

**Brenda Marshall**

**From:** Greta Anderson [ganderson@biologicaldiversity.org]  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 31, 2007 11:23 AM  
**To:** Mayes-WebEmail; Gleason-WebEmail; Mundell-Web  
**Subject:** THANK YOU FOR PROTECTING THE KOFA!

47

Thank you for voting not to issue a Certificate of Environmental Compatibility to Southern California Edison for the Devers-Palo Verde No. 2 Transmission Line Project. I appreciate the stand you took to not make Arizona California's power plant, and the protection your decisions offers to the Kofa National Wildlife Refuge. Wildplace and wildlife are important to me and to the residents of Arizona, and they should not be sold out to support California's unsustainable energy needs.

Thank you!

Greta Anderson  
831 S. 8th Ave  
Tucson, Arizona 85701

Arizona Corporation Commission  
**DOCKETED**  
JUN -1 2007

DOCKETED BY	NR
-------------	----

AZ CORP COMMISSION  
DOCKET CONTROL

2007 JUN -1 P 2:30

RECEIVED

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Kevin Gaither-Banchoff [kevin@azwild.org]  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 31, 2007 10:48 AM  
**To:** Gleason-WebEmail; Hatch-WebEmail; Mayes-WebEmail; Pierce-Web; Mundell-Web  
**Subject:** ACC Vote to Deny the Devers to Palo Verde 2 Power Line

Dear Chairman Mike Gleason, Commissioner Jeff Hatch-Miller, Commissioner Kris Mayes, Commissioner Gary Pierce, and Commissioner Bill Mundell,

I wanted to send all of you a brief note today thanking you for your vote to deny a Certificate of Environmental Compatibility to Southern California Edison for the Devers-Palo Verde No. 2 Transmission Line Project (DPV2). This power lines identified route would have cut across important and sensitive wildlife habitat, including the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge.

I look forward to seeing similar long term and thoughtful decision being made by the Corporation Commission. Again, thank you. Please feel free to contact me if you have any questions.

Kevin Gaither-Banchoff  
Executive Director  
Arizona Wilderness Coalition  
PO Box 40340  
Tucson, AZ 85717  
520/326-4300 – office  
520/869-4673 – cell  
[www.azwild.org](http://www.azwild.org)

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Jenna LILLIBRIDGE [lilliputia@msn.com]

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 7:17 PM

**To:** Mundell-Web

**Subject:** Thank you for your vote against the Devers to Palo Verde 2 Power Line

Arizona's native flora and fauna matter to me, your consideration is very appreciated,  
Jenna R. Lillibridge  
Concerned Citizen

---

Change is good. See what's different about Windows Live Hotmail. [Check it out!](#)

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Fareed Abou-Haidar [fdadlion@cox.net]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 7:06 PM  
**To:** Mundell-Web  
**Subject:** Thank You!

Dear Mr. Mundell,

Just a quick thank you for voting against the Devers to Palo Verde 2 power line that would have destroyed wildlife habitat, especially in KOFA National Wildlife Refuge. In a state besieged by out-of-control growth and so many environmental problems, it's good to hear uplifting news for a change.

Again, thank you very much.

Fareed Abou-Haidar  
Mesa

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** RICHARD RUPP [ramrupp@msn.com]

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 7:05 PM

**To:** Mundell-Web

Thank you for protecting KOFA.

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Lynn DeMuth [lmdemuth@cox.net]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 7:01 PM  
**To:** Mundell-Web  
**Subject:** Devers power line vote

Dear Commissioner Mundell,

Thank you for denying the Devers to Palo Verde 2 power line today. I especially appreciate that this protects the Kofa National Wildlife Refuge.

Sincerely,

Lynn DeMuth  
Chandler, AZ

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Michelle Pulich Stewart [sun7river@yahoo.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 4:47 PM  
**To:** Gleason-WebEmail; Mayes-WebEmail; Mundell-Web; Hatch-WebEmail; Pierce-Web  
**Subject:** KOFA Refuge is so very important to me and to Habitat!

May 30, 2007

Dear Chairman Gleason and Commissioners:

I am writing out of deep concern for KOFA National Wildlife Refuge. Please reject the Certificate of Environmental Compatibility for the Devers to Palo Verde 2 Transmission Line Project. It is not in the broader public interest. This proposed line will bring few worthwhile benefits to Arizona rate payers. I understand that it is likely to result in increased rates for Arizonans. The proposed line would harm this valuable habitat area. The proposed line is clearly incompatible with the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge as was determined by the Refuge manager, and would also negatively impact other sensitive public lands in our state.

This transmission line is contrary to the National Wildlife Refuge System mission and would hinder the efforts of the Refuge staff to meet the mandates of that mission. A second power transmission line would further fragment and reduce the quality and quantity of habitats on the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge. By that standard alone the proposed new 500 KV line is incompatible with the mission of the Refuge.

The Right-of-Way through KOFA is through prime desert bighorn sheep and desert tortoise habitat. The potential effects of another power line on bighorn sheep, especially on movement across the power line right-of-way and during the lambing period, are clearly contrary to the purposes for which the refuge was established. Considering that the population of sheep in the area is estimated to be down to 390 animals, a drop of approximately 230 animals from 2003 and down from 812 animals in 2000, it is prudent to be cautious about introducing further disturbances.

The line will also further obstruct the natural view of the area that is pristine desert landscape and clearly negatively affect the wilderness values of the Refuge. Visual impacts as well as recreational impacts on the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge would be significant and could not be mitigated. Adding additional industrial features to the landscape is a significant adverse visual change. The project would change the character of the KOFA and significantly diminish its recreational value as well.

The Final Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement ("EIR/EIS") on this proposed project indicates clearly that the impact of the DPV2 transmission line on the Kofa will be irreparable and unmitigable. According to the EIR/EIS, the negative visual impacts in the Kofa National Wildlife Refuge would be significant and unmitigable (page ES-41).

The project would change the character of the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge and significantly diminish its recreational value as well. On page D.5-22 of the Final EIR/EIS, it states:

"Overall, development and operation of the project would change the character of the Kofa NWR and significantly diminish its recreational value. Impacts to the Kofa NWR would be significant and unmitigable (Class I)."

The Power Plant and Line Siting Committee was charged with reviewing a number of factors including the total

5/31/2007

environment of the area, fish, wildlife and plant life and associated forms of life upon which they are dependent, existing scenic areas, and more, and it is to "give special consideration to the protection of areas unique because of biological wealth or because they are habitats for rare and endangered species." There is no doubt that the KOFA is unique and should be given special consideration.

The DVP2 is unnecessary for an adequate, economical and reliable supply of electric power for Arizona and would cause significant damage to our precious Arizona public lands. It is clear that the benefits of this project to Arizona and to Arizona ratepayers are limited, at best, and that the environmental impacts are significant. Because of this, I strongly urge the Arizona Corporation Commission to reject the Certificate of Environmental Compatibility for the Devers to Palo Verde 2 Transmission Line.

Thank you for considering my comments.

Sincerely,  
Michelle Pulich Stewart  
2142 E. La Jolla Dr  
Tempe, AZ 85282

---

Looking for earth-friendly autos?  
[Browse Top Cars by "Green Rating" at Yahoo! Autos' Green Center.](#)

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Jim / Kathy McCarthy [jk436mc@npgcable.com]

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 8:41 PM

**To:** Mundell-Web

**Subject:** Devers PV Vote

Bill, thanks for your vote on the Devers PV line. If you decide to run for Congress again, let me know.

Jim McCarthy

5/31/2007

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Liz Wise [lizw01@frontiernet.net]

**Sent:** Thursday, May 31, 2007 9:47 AM

**To:** Mundell-Web

Thanks for your wise decision protecting the KOFA Wildlife Refuge

Liz Wise

Vernon, AZ

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Sandy Doty [ferretgal@wbhsi.net]  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 31, 2007 9:12 AM  
**To:** Mundell-Web  
**Subject:** A BIG THANK YOU!!!

**Dear Commissioner Mundell,**

**I was so relieved to see that our good Corporation Commission has come through for us once again! Thank you for both protecting our state and we, the ratepayers when you voted against Southern California Edison's plan to install energy transmission lines from Arizona to California. You asked the right questions and made the most appropriate point that Arizona is growing and will need that energy. There was no benefit for Arizona as far as I could see.**

**Keep up the good work!**

**Sandra L. Doty, Chairperson  
Sun Lakes Republican Club  
Member-at-Large Maricopa County Republican Committee Executive Guidance Council**

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** roundriver@gmail.com on behalf of Daniel R. Patterson [swpeer@peer.org]  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 31, 2007 8:44 AM  
**To:** Gleason-WebEmail; Mayes-WebEmail; Mundell-Web; Hatch-WebEmail; Pierce-Web  
**Cc:** lfaeth@az.gov; bbrooks@az.gov; Sandy Bahr; krlsss1 Ron Kearns; Paul\_Cornes@fws.gov; Refugekeeper; Kelly Fuller; Kondor, Rachel; stevtabor@aol.com; Terry Weiner; Donna and Larry Charpiet; todd@tjsafari.com; jwilliams@azwild.org; Cary Meister  
**Subject:** Re: PEER urges 'no' on Devers-Palo Verde powerline

Hon. Commissioners -- Thank you for your wise votes yesterday against the SCE powerline and in favor of protecting the Kofa NWR.

Daniel Patterson  
SW PEER  
Tucson

\*

On 5/29/07, **Daniel R. Patterson** <swpeer@peer.org> wrote:

Arizona Corporation Commission  
Commissioners Wing  
1200 W. Washington - 2nd Floor  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Dear Chairman Gleason and Commissioners:

PEER is a national non-profit alliance of local, state and federal scientists, law enforcement officers, land managers and other professionals dedicated to upholding environmental laws and values. We have our southwest office in Tucson.

PEER is writing to ask that the Arizona Corporation Commission **reject the Certificate of Environmental Compatibility for the Devers to Palo Verde 2 Transmission Line Project**. It is not in the broader public interest. This proposed line will bring little, if any, benefits to Arizona rate payers and in fact is likely to result in increased rates for Arizonans, while at the time doing significant environmental harm. The proposed line is clearly incompatible with the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge as was determined by the Refuge manager, and would also negatively impact other sensitive public lands in our state.

This transmission line is contrary to the National Wildlife Refuge System mission and would hinder the efforts of the Refuge staff to meet the mandates of that mission. A second power transmission line would further fragment and reduce the quality and quantity of habitats on the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge. By that standard alone the proposed new 500 KV line is incompatible with the mission of the Refuge.

5/31/2007

The Right-of-Way through KOFA is through prime desert bighorn sheep and desert tortoise habitat. The potential effects of another power line on bighorn sheep, especially on movement across the power line right-of-way and during the lambing period, are clearly contrary to the purposes for which the refuge was established. Considering that the population of sheep in the area is estimated to be down to 390 animals, a drop of approximately 230 animals from 2003 and down from 812 animals in 2000, it is prudent to be cautious about introducing further disturbances.

In addition, potential impacts to reptiles, either attempting to cross roads or no longer able to cross the right-of-way because of its width, and migratory birds striking the power lines are also clearly contrary to the purposes of the refuge and its management mandates.

The line will also further obstruct the natural view of the area that is pristine desert landscape and clearly negatively affect the wilderness values of the Refuge. Visual impacts as well as recreational impacts on the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge would be significant and could not be mitigated. Adding additional industrial features to the landscape is a significant adverse visual change. The project would change the character of the KOFA and significantly diminish its recreational value as well.

The Final Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement ("EIR/EIS") on this proposed project indicates clearly that the impact of the DPV2 transmission line on the Kofa will be irreparable and unmitigable. According to the EIR/EIS, the negative visual impacts in the Kofa National Wildlife Refuge would be significant and unmitigable (page ES-41).

The project would change the character of the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge and significantly diminish its recreational value as well. On page D.5-22 of the Final EIR/EIS, it states:

"Overall, development and operation of the project would change the character of the Kofa NWR and significantly diminish its recreational value. Impacts to the Kofa NWR would be significant and unmitigable (Class I)."

The Power Plant and Line Siting Committee was charged with reviewing a number of factors including the total environment of the area, fish, wildlife and plant life and associated forms of life upon which they are dependent, existing scenic areas, and more, and it is to "give special consideration to the protection of areas unique because of biological wealth or because they are habitats for rare and endangered species." There is no doubt that the KOFA is unique and should be given special consideration.

The DVP2 is unnecessary for an adequate, economical and reliable supply of electric power for Arizona and would cause significant damage to our precious Arizona public lands. It is clear that the benefits of this project to Arizona and to Arizona ratepayers are limited, at best, and that the environmental impacts are significant. Because of this, **PEER strongly urges the Arizona Corporation Commission to reject the Certificate of Environmental Compatibility for the Devers to Palo Verde 2 Transmission Line.**

Thank you,

Daniel R. Patterson  
Ecologist & Southwest Director  
Public Employees for Environmental Responsibility (PEER.org)

520.906.2159  
738 N. 5th Av. #210; POB 172, Tucson AZ 85702-0172 USA

PEER protects employees who protect our environment.

Washington DC (HQ); Alaska; California; Florida; Maine; New England; New Jersey; Refuge Keeper; Rocky Mountain; Southwest; Tennessee; Texas; Washington

--

Daniel R. Patterson  
Ecologist & Southwest Director  
Public Employees for Environmental Responsibility (PEER.org)

520.906.2159  
738 N. 5th Av. #210; POB 172, Tucson AZ 85702-0172 USA

PEER protects employees who protect our environment.

Washington DC (HQ); Alaska; California; Florida; Maine; New England; New Jersey; Refuge Keeper; Rocky Mountain; Southwest; Tennessee; Texas; Washington

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Judith Schmidt [judith\_schmidt@hotmail.com]  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 31, 2007 8:13 AM  
**To:** Mundell-Web; Mayes-WebEmail  
**Subject:** Thank you

Mr. Mundell and Ms. Mayes,

Thank you for voting against Southern California Edison. California wants everybody else to build power plants but themselves. When was the last time California built a power plant in their state?

Thank you,

Robert & Judy Schmidt

---

Download Messenger. Start an i'm conversation. Support a cause. [Join Now!](#)

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** mark grenard [haydukeaz@yahoo.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 10:28 PM  
**To:** Mundell-Web  
**Subject:** Thank you for voting down the big CA power lines.

Thanks again.  
Peace,  
Mark Hayduke Grenard

---

Expecting? Get great news right away with email Auto-Check.  
Try the Yahoo! Mail Beta.  
[http://advision.webevents.yahoo.com/mailbeta/newmail\\_tools.html](http://advision.webevents.yahoo.com/mailbeta/newmail_tools.html)

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Lee [cloler@cox.net]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 9:51 PM  
**To:** Mayes-WebEmail; Gleason-WebEmail; Pierce-Web; Hatch-WebEmail; Mundell-Web  
**Subject:** Kofa

Dear Commission Chair and Members:

Thank you very much for denying a Certificate of Environmental Compatibility to Southern California Edison for the Devers-Palo Verde No. 2 Transmission Line Project (DPV2). This route would have cut across important and sensitive wildlife habitat, including the KOFA National Wildlife Refuge. This is great news for the Refuge and its wildlife.

Kofa Wildlife Refuge holds good memories for me of camping with my parents, wild palm trees, watching the really bright stars rise over the mountains, and the chance of seeing bighorn sheep.

Thanks very much for keeping Kofa the way it is now.

Sincerely,

Lee Oler

Tucson AZ

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** James Vaaler [jimvaaler@msn.com]

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 9:41 PM

**To:** Mundell-Web

**Subject:** Palo Verde - Devers

Bill Mundell,  
Thank you for voting to protect the Kofa Wildlife Refuge from more power line corridors.  
Jim Vaaler

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** TGWoods [twoodsjr@cox.net]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 9:28 PM  
**To:** Mundell-Web  
**Subject:** Devers Line.

**Bill, My compliments to you and Commission on denial.**

**It was totally clear from the start that this was a case to decide if Arizona was to be an energy farm for CA.**

**You clearly sent a strong message that will benefit our State in the future.**

**I am doing pretty well; still very active with Az Heritage Alliance and G&F matters.**

**Tom Woods**

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Nancy LaPlaca [nancylaplaca@yahoo.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 8:38 PM  
**To:** 'Nancy LaPlaca'; Gleason-WebEmail; Mundell-Web; Hatch-WebEmail; Mayes-WebEmail; Pierce-Web  
**Subject:** Thank you for voting "no" on Devers to Palo Verde 2 Transmission Project

Thank you so much! We don't need this line, and can accomplish more with energy efficiency and distributed generation.  
YOUR LEADERSHIP IS APPRECIATED!

Sincerely,

Nancy LaPlaca

4801 W. Yale Ave.

Denver CO 80219

**Nancy LaPlaca**  
303-588-3937

*If you add up the energy required to extract and transport coal, plus heat conversion and transmission line loss, only 3% of the energy created by coal-fired power plants reaches an electrical outlet. -Amory Lovins, Scientific American, Sept. 2005.*

**Brenda Marshall**

---

**From:** Jenni And Paul [paulandjenni@hotmail.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 30, 2007 8:35 PM  
**To:** Mundell-Web  
**Subject:** Thank you for KOFA preservation.

Commissioner Mundell-

Thank you for your decision to vote against that rotten power line idea today. I hike alot in the New Water Mountians. The sheep I have seen there, I am sure, also thank you. You have stood up for Arizona. We do not need to destroy our beautiful state in order to become California's utility closet and I am glad that you have decided the way you did. I appreciate your decision and you will have my support during the next election.

Thank you,

Paul Franckowiak

10109 S. 29th Drive  
Laveen Az. 85339

---

PC Magazine's 2007 editors' choice for best Web mail—award-winning Windows Live Hotmail.