



0000021828

22

COMMISSIONERS
JEFF HATCH-MILLER - Chairman
WILLIAM A. MUNDELL
MARC SPITZER
MIKE GLEASON
KRISTIN K. MAYES



ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION

Arizona Corporation Commission

DOCKETED

JUN 28 2005

DATE: JUNE 28, 2005

DOCKET NO: W-02111A-05-0167

TO ALL PARTIES:

DOCKETED BY

Enclosed please find the recommendation of Chief Administrative Law Lyn Farmer. The recommendation has been filed in the form of an Opinion and Order on:

**SABROSA WATER COMPANY
(EMERGENCY RATE INCREASE)**

Pursuant to A.A.C. R14-3-110(B), you may file exceptions to the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge by filing an original and ten (10) copies of the exceptions with the Commission's Docket Control at the address listed below by **4:00** p.m. on or before:

JULY 7, 2005

The enclosed is NOT an order of the Commission, but a recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge to the Commissioners. Consideration of this matter has tentatively been scheduled for the Commission's Working Session and Open Meeting to be held on:

JULY 12, 2005 and JULY 13, 2005

For more information, you may contact Docket Control at (602) 542-3477 or the Hearing Division at (602)542-4250. For information about the Open Meeting, contact the Executive Secretary's Office at (602) 542-3931.

RECEIVED

2005 JUN 28 P 3:54

AZ CORP COMMISSION
DOCUMENT CONTROL

BRIAN C. McNEIL
EXECUTIVE SECRETARY

1 **-BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION**

2 COMMISSIONERS

3 JEFF HATCH-MILLER, Chairman
4 WILLIAM A. MUNDELL
5 MARC SPITZER
6 MIKE GLEASON
7 KRISTIN K. MAYES

8 IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF
9 SABROSA WATER COMPANY FOR AN
10 EMERGENCY RATE INCREASE.

DOCKET NO. W-02111A-05-0167

DECISION NO. _____

11 OPINION AND ORDER

12 DATE OF HEARING: May 6, 2005
13 PLACE OF HEARING: Phoenix, Arizona
14 ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE: Lyn Farmer
15 APPEARANCES: Mr. Raymond S. Heyman, ROSHKA, HEYMAN &
16 DeWULF, on behalf of Sabrosa Water Company;
17 Mr. Dennis Schumacher, Intervenor; in pro personia;
18 and
19 Mr. Jason Gellman, Staff Attorney, Legal Division, on
20 behalf of the Utilities Division of the Arizona
21 Corporation Commission.

22 **BY THE COMMISSION:**

23 On March 8, 2005, Sabrosa Water Company ("Sabrosa" or "Company") filed the above-
24 captioned application for emergency interim rate relief with the Arizona Corporation Commission
25 ("Commission").

26 On March 22, 2005, Sabrosa filed a Supplement to the March 8, 2005, emergency rate
27 application.

28 On April 19, 2005, Mr. Dennis Schumacher filed a Request for Intervention.

On May 6, 2005, a hearing was held in the above-captioned matter. The Utilities Division
Staff ("Staff"), Sabrosa and Mr. Dennis Schumacher appeared at the hearing and Mr. Schumacher's
Request for Intervention was granted.

...

...

* * * * *

1
2 Having considered the entire record herein and being fully advised in the premises, the
3 Commission finds, concludes, and orders that:

4 **FINDINGS OF FACT**

5 1. Sabrosa provides water service to approximately 65 customers located in the New
6 River, Arizona area.

7 2. On May 11, 2000, the Commission issued a Complaint and Order to Show Cause
8 against Sabrosa alleging a lack of ability to provide adequate and continued water service to its
9 customers and for violation of the Rules of the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality
10 ("ADEQ"). In Decision No. 63136 (November 16, 2000), the Commission authorized the
11 Commission's Utilities Division Staff ("Staff") to engage a qualified management entity to operate
12 and manage Sabrosa in order to bring the Company into full compliance with Arizona law, the
13 Commission's Rules and Orders.¹ The Commission further fined the owner of Sabrosa, Mr. Keith J.
14 Morris, a penalty of \$5,000 as well as ongoing penalties for failure to comply with Arizona law. Mr.
15 Morris has not paid the penalty and has abandoned the utility. In 2000, Arizona American Water
16 Company ("AAWC") was appointed interim manager for Sabrosa.

17 3. On April 24, 2002, the Staff filed another Complaint against Sabrosa, alleging
18 violations of law and Commission Rules and Orders, and requesting cancellation of Sabrosa's
19 Certificate of Convenience and Necessity ("Certificate" or "CC&N"). In Decision No. 65217
20 (September 24, 2002), the Commission cancelled Sabrosa's CC&N and reaffirmed the financial
21 penalties order in Decision No. 63136.²

22 4. On approximately February 1, 2005, Global Water Resources, LLC ("Global") was
23 appointed the successor interim manager for Sabrosa. According to Global, during its due diligence,
24 it learned that in "addition to ownership, financial and operational issues, Sabrosa has substantial
25 problems with water quality and quantity, infrastructure and expandability."³ Global states that it
26

27 ¹ In 2000, Arizona American Water Company was appointed interim manager and served until approximately January 31,
2005.

28 ² Those Commission Orders have been referred to the Attorney General's Offices for enforcement. (TR. p. 16)

³ March 8, 2005 Application at p.2.

1 will attempt to operate Sabrosa for the immediate benefit of the customers, and also intends to fix
2 problems and rehabilitate the utility to provide safe, reliable and adequate water.

3 5. On March 8, 2005, Sabrosa filed this Application, indicating that it is plagued with
4 serious financial, operational and water quality and quantity problems that jeopardize its ability to
5 provide ongoing adequate, reliable and safe water to its customers. The application stated that
6 Sabrosa has been, and will be for the immediate future, operated by interim managers and that its
7 rates are not sufficient to operate the utility or fix its problems.

8 6. On April 1, 2005, Sabrosa filed its Notice of Filing Affidavit of Mailing, stating that it
9 had mailed a copy of the notice of the Application for Emergency Interim Rates to all customers on
10 March 30, 2005.⁴

11 7. According to Sabrosa, the problems that constitute the emergency include: (i)
12 inadequate water supplies; (2) marginal to poor water quality; (iii) poorly maintained equipment and
13 infrastructure; (iv) a series of financial and legal problems as a result of ownership abandonment; and
14 (v) confiscatory rates.

15 8. According to the Staff Report, the Company's water supply and the size of its water
16 system are inadequate to meet the needs of current customers. During the summer months in 2003
17 and 2004, the Company did not have enough water to meet the demand and had to buy water from
18 AAWC. Sabrosa has three production wells that are essentially shallow domestic wells drilled into
19 fractured rock. Inspection of the three wells indicated that each well will need significant repairs or
20 will have to be replaced.⁵ Staff inspected the system and verified that the system indeed had the
21 problems that were stated in the Company's application. (Tr. p. 97) The sizes of the water lines are
22 too small and may not be looped, causing a lack of circulation. Additionally, the water system's
23 pressure is usually at or below minimum standards and is not able to sustain pressure for critical "fire
24 flow". Staff found the water system to be in general disrepair. According to the Company, the
25 infrastructure problems are compounded by the lack of system maps and the failure to have a
26 dedicated line maintenance program.

27
28 ⁴ Global also held a public town hall meeting in February and discussed the need for a rate increase. (TR. p. 30)

⁵ The Zorillo well failed on February 12, 2005 and required the complete replacement of pump, motor and controller.

1 9. According to Staff and the Company, the Company's current water quality is not
2 meeting water quality standards. The arsenic levels are approximately 35 ppb; recent samples of
3 Sabrosa's water tested positive for total coliform; and samples from at least two of the wells have
4 indicated the presence of nitrates. In its Supplement to Application for Emergency Interim Rate
5 Relief filed on March 22, 2005, Sabrosa indicated that based upon nitrate results from samples taken
6 in March, the Wright Well was isolated from the Sabrosa distribution system and customers were
7 mailed a "Notice of Exceedance."

8 10. According to the Application, one of the major problems with Sabrosa is the
9 "quagmire of legal issues that its owner has created", including abandonment of the utility and its
10 customers while maintaining legal title to the assets, including real property; the cancellation of the
11 CC&N; and the nonpayment of property taxes⁶. These negative factors are a deterrent to third party
12 investment in Sabrosa, and make it "virtually impossible to secure needed funding to improve the
13 Sabrosa system." The Application states that the former interim operator lost between \$25,000 and
14 \$50,000 annually in direct operational costs.

15 11. According to Staff, Sabrosa's rates do not provide sufficient revenue to pay its
16 operating expenses and to correct its capacity and water quality problems. The Staff Report indicates
17 that the Company is not current on its property taxes; cannot meet needed repairs and perform
18 required maintenance; and is incurring legal expenses to address legal issues caused by its owner.

19 12. According to Sabrosa, the goal of the proposed rates is to restore Sabrosa to
20 operational stability, including allowing for an infusion of capital for pump and line repair and
21 replacement (TR. p. 33)

22 13. The Company testified that current revenues are approximately \$28,000, but that
23 approximately \$90,000 of revenue a year is needed to cover expenses. This increase in revenues
24 would increase the typical residential customer's bill, based upon usage of 8,569 gallons, from
25 \$34.21 to \$107.62. The current base rates and the proposed interim emergency rates are as set forth
26 below:

27
28 ⁶ Sabrosa owes approximately \$400,000 to Maricopa County in back property taxes.

	<u>Current Rates</u>	<u>Company Proposed Emergency Rates</u>
Monthly Minimum Charge Based on 5/8 – inch Meter	\$17.50	\$39.50
Gallons in Minimum	1,000	0
Commodity Charge:		
0 to 3,000 gallons, per 1,000 gallons	\$1.95	\$6.00
3,001 to 10,000 gallons, per 1,000 gallons	1.95	9.00
10,001 and over gallons, per 1,000 gallons	1.95	10.80

14. Intervenor Schumacher testified that he has been a customer of Sabrosa's for five years and that the Company has substantial, and maybe insurmountable problems, including both water quantity and quality issues, including contaminated wells, a system in disrepair with no accurate system distribution map, and no opportunity for growth to help solve the problems. Mr. Schumacher testified that since Global took over as interim manager this year, he has received several letters from them, notifying customers of what is being done, and his water service has not been interrupted. Mr. Schumacher agrees that the rate increase is necessary, but questions whether rates necessary to ultimately solve the Company's problems could be successfully implemented.

15. In *Residential Utility Consumer Office v. Arizona Corp. Com'n* (App. Div. 1 2001) 199 Ariz. 588, 20 P.3d 1169, the court agreed with the *Scates*⁷ court's approval of the circumstances in which interim rates may be considered and approved by the Commission. "*Scates* follows the Attorney General's conclusion that, while the Commission has broad authority when setting rates, the interim rate-making authority is limited to circumstances in which (1) an emergency exists; (2) a bond is posted by the utility guaranteeing a refund to customers if the interim rates paid are higher than the final rates determined by the Commission; and (3) the Commission undertakes to determine final rates after a valuation of the utility's property. 118 Ariz. At 535, 578 P.2d at 616 (following the

⁷ *Scates v. Arizona Corp. Comm'n*, 118 Ariz. 531, 578 P.2d 612.

1 conclusion drawn in Op. Att'y Gen 71-17)."⁸

2 16. According to Attorney General Opinion No. 71-17, interim or emergency rates are
3 proper when either all or any one of the following conditions occur: when sudden change brings
4 hardship to a Company; when the Company is insolvent; or when the condition of the Company is
5 such that its ability to maintain service pending a formal rate determination is in serious doubt.

6 17. Staff recommends that the Commission approve the requested interim rates, stating
7 that the Company is not currently providing adequate service and there is no reasonable expectation
8 that it could begin to provide adequate service at existing rates. Staff believes that implementation of
9 emergency rates may prevent further deterioration of the perilous condition of this system.

10 18. Staff further recommends that Sabrosa file a permanent rate application by May 31,
11 2006, using a test year ending March 31, 2006; that the interim rates be subject to refund pending the
12 decision on the permanent rate case; and that the Company post a bond in the amount of \$10 prior to
13 implementing the emergency rate increase authorized in this proceeding.

14 19. Staff's recommendations above comply with the law concerning the Commission's
15 ability to implement interim rates, however, we believe that a bond of \$10 is inadequate for
16 "guaranteeing a refund to customers if the interim rates paid are higher than the final rates determined
17 by the Commission". We realize that the Company's poor financial condition is the reason that it
18 filed this application, but we cannot ignore the requirement that the customers are to be protected if
19 the interim rates are higher than the final rates. Accordingly, we will require a bond in the amount
20 \$7,000, which is approximately 5 percent of the increase in annual revenues allowed in this
21 emergency rate application.

22 CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

23 1. Sabrosa is a public service corporation pursuant to A.R.S. §§ 40-250 and 251.

24 2. The Commission has jurisdiction over Sabrosa and the subject matter of the
25 application.

26 3. Notice of the Application was provided in accordance with the law.
27

28 ⁸ RUCO at 591.

1 4. Sabrosa is facing an "emergency" within the definition set forth in Attorney General
 2 Opinion No. 71-17.

3 5. The emergency rate increase requested herein is just and reasonable on an interim
 4 basis and should be granted.

5 6. The recommendations set forth in Findings of Fact Nos. 17 and 18 as modified herein
 6 are reasonable and should be adopted.

7 **ORDER**

8 IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Sabrosa Water Company shall file on or before July 29,
 9 2005, a revised tariff that allows for the following interim emergency rates:

	<u>Rates</u>
10 Monthly Minimum Charge	
11 Based on 5/8 – inch Meter	\$39.50
12 Commodity Charge:	
13 0 to 3,000 gallons, per 1,000 gallons	\$6.00
14 3,001 to 10,000 gallons, per 1,000 gallons	9.00
15 10,001 and over gallons, per 1,000 gallons	10.80

16 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the above rates and charges shall be effective for all service
 17 provided on and after August 1, 2005.

18 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Sabrosa Water Company shall file an a permanent rate case
 19 application using a test year ending March 31, 2006, no later than May 31, 2006.

20 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Sabrosa Water Company shall post a bond in the amount of
 21 \$7,000 prior to implementing the new emergency interim rates.

22 ...
 23 ...
 24 ...
 25 ...
 26 ...
 27 ...

28

1 ...

2 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Sabrosa Water Company shall notify its customers of the
3 rates authorized herein and their effective date within 15 days of the effective date of this Order.

4 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Decision shall become effective immediately.

5 BY ORDER OF THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION.
6
7

8 CHAIRMAN _____ COMMISSIONER _____

9
10 COMMISSIONER _____ COMMISSIONER _____ COMMISSIONER _____

11
12 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I, BRIAN C. McNEIL, Executive
13 Secretary of the Arizona Corporation Commission, have
14 hereunto set my hand and caused the official seal of the
15 Commission to be affixed at the Capitol, in the City of Phoenix,
16 this ____ day of _____, 2005.

17
18 _____
19 BRIAN C. McNEIL
20 EXECUTIVE SECRETARY

21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000

18 DISSENT _____
19 DISSENT _____
20 LF:dap

1 SERVICE LIST FOR: SABROSA WATER COMPANY

2 DOCKET NO.: W-02111A-05-0167

3
4 Raymond S. Heyman
5 Michael W. Patten
6 ROSHKA, HEYMAN & DeWULF
7 One Arizona Center
8 400 E. Van Buren, Suite 800
9 Phoenix, Arizona 85004
10 Attorneys for Sabrosa Water Company

11 Dennis Schumacher
12 123 W. Sabrosa Drive
13 Phoenix, Arizona 85087

14 Christopher Kempsey, Chief Counsel
15 ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
16 1200 W. Washington Street
17 Phoenix, Arizona 85007

18 Ernest Johnson, Director of Utilities
19 ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
20 1200 W. Washington Street
21 Phoenix, Arizona 85007

22
23
24
25
26
27
28